BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10084452 1

Store
KF
1536
ZA2
M23
1976
v.1

McDonnell, Thomas Edward
Cases and materials relating to debtor and creditor. 1976-77

Store
KF
1536
ZA2
M23
1976
v.1

CASES AND MATERIALS RELATING TO

DEBTOR & CREDITOR

1976-1977

These materials are intended for the instructional and research purposes of students at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto and are not for publication in any form.

The authors reserve all rights in these materials.

Professors T.E. McDonnell,
B. Reiter,
M.J. Trebilcock

Faculty of Law,
University of Toronto.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
CHAPTER 1: THE NATURE OF A DEBT	2
A. THE DISTINCTION BETWEEN DEBT AND DAMAGES	2
(a) Salmond and Williams, Law of Contracts	2
B. THE ADVANTAGES OF SUING IN DEBT	2
(a) Note	2
(b) Case #1, White & Carter (Councils) Ltd. v. McGregor	3
(c) Case #2, Bridge v. Campbell Discount Co.Ltd.	5
(d) Note: The Developing Doctrine of Unconscionability	10
C. THE DISCHARGING OF DEBTS: THE SPECIAL PROBLEM OF PART PAYMENT	11
(a) Note	11
(b) Case #3, D. & C. Builders v. Rees	12
(c) Note on Promissory Estoppel	16
(d) Mercantile Law Amendment Act	18
(e) Case #4, Champlain Ready-Mixed Concrete v. Beaupre	18
D. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN THE PROTECTION OF CONSUMER DEBTORS	20
(a) Protection Prior to or at Point of Sale	20
1. Uniformity in Consumer Contracts	20
2. Disclosure of Financial Terms	20
3. The Cooling-off Period in Door to Door Telephone Solicitation Sales	21
4. Unsolicited Goods and Credit Cards	21
5. Unfair Business Practices	22
(b) The Regulation of Financial Charges	25
(c) The Rights of Assignees of the Contract	25
1. Consumer Notes	25
2. Cut-off Clauses: The Assignees of Rights of a Lender	26

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialsre01mcdo

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		PAGE
CHAPTER 2:	THE NATURE OF THE CREDIT MARKET	29
A.	THE CREDIT USERS	29
	(a) Report of the National Commission on Consumer Finance, Consumer Credit in the United States	29
	(b) Some Canadian Figures	33
B.	THE CREDIT GRANTORS	36
	Figures from the Canadian Consumer Credit Factbook, 1974	
C.	THE ROLE OF CREDIT	37
	Trebilcock, An Essay on the Economic and Social Role of Consumer Credit in Canada Today	
D.	IS CREDIT USED EXCESSIVELY?	45
	Report of the National Commission on Consumer Finance, Consumer Credit in the United States	

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		PAGE
CHAPTER 3: THE ECONOMICS OF DEBT COLLECTION		48
A.	THE NATURE OF TRANSACTION COSTS	50
	(a) Leff, "Injury, Ignorance and Spite--The Dynamics of Coercive Collection"	50
	(b) Transaction Costs Illustrated	71
	(c) Questions	71
B.	SMALL CLAIMS COURT AS A MECHANISM FOR COLLECTION	72
	Ison, "Small Claims"	
C.	MARKET CONSIDERATIONS	74
	(a) Cayne and Trebilcock, "Market Considerations in the Formulation of Consumer Protection Policy"	74
	(b) The Exclusionary and Degenerative Consequences Illustrated	78
	(c) D. Caplovitz, Alternative Systems of Consumer Credit	79
D.	RELIEF FOR THE OVERCOMMITTED DEBTOR	83
	(a) Who is the Overcommitted Debtor?	
	(i) Trebilcock and Shulman, The Pathology of Credit Breakdown	83
	(ii) Reasons for Default: Caplovitz, Consumers in Trouble	88
	(iii) Extent of Indebtedness: Trebilcock and Shulman, The Pathology of Credit Breakdown	90
	(iv) Ziegel vs. Bray Debate	90a
	(b) The Credit Counselling Service of Metropolitan Toronto	91
	(c) The Small Claims Court Referee	91
	(d) Bankruptcy	94
	(e) Changing the Rules of the Game: Trebilcock and Shulman, The Pathology of Credit Breakdown	95

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
CHAPTER 4: DEBT AND INVASION OF PRIVACY	101
A. THE NATURE OF THE PROBLEM	102
(a) Departments of Communications and of Justice, Privacy and Computers	102
(b) Westin, The Snooping Machine	108
(c) Ryan, Privacy, Orthodoxy and Democracy	110
(d) A Specimen Credit Report	113
B. THE COMMON LAW RESPONSE	115
(a) Note	115
(b) Privacy and Computers	117
(c) Sharp, Credit Reporting and Privacy	118
C. THE REGULATORY RESPONSE	119
(a) The Consumer Reporting Act	119
(b) Note	126
(c) Ziegel, "The Case for a Credit Register"	127

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 5: SELF-HELP COLLECTION		128
A. THE SCOPE OF THE PROBLEM		129
(a)	B.C. Law Reform Commission, Report on Debtor Creditor Relationships	129
(b)	Report of the Committee on Enforcement of Judgment Debts (Payne Committee)	134
(c)	"Harassing the Debtor", Consumer Reports	135
(d)	Caplovitz, Consumers In Trouble	137
(e)	Note: Some Recent Developments in Tort Law	138
(f)	Some Dunning Letters	140
(g)	Sherwin, Locating the Missing Judgment Debtor	144
(h)	Contacting the Debtor's Employer	145
	Case #5, Larry Dwayne Sawatzky v. Credit Bureau of Edmonton Limited	146
(i)	Collections By Lawyers	148
(j)	Using the Criminal Law to Collect a Debt	148
B. LEGISLATION ON HARASSMENT AND DEBT COLLECTION		149
(a)	The Debt Collectors Act	149
(b)	The Collection Agencies Act	149
(c)	The Bailiffs Act	152

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 6: ACTIONS PRIOR TO JUDGMENT

	PAGE
A. THE QUESTION OF DUE PROCESS	154
(a) Note	154
(b) Report of the National Commission on Consumer Finance, Consumer Credit in the United States	157
B. CREDITORS' RELIEF ACT	163
C. PROCEDURES FOR ATTACHING PROPERTY	164
(a) Absconding Debtors Act	164
(b) The Small Claims Court Act	165
(c) Case # 6, Thomsen v. Whitman	165
D. PRE-TRIAL GARNISHMENT	168
(a) The Small Claims Court Act	168
(b) The Wages Act	169
E. ARREST	169
(a) Fraudulent Debtors Arrest Act	169
(b) Case # 7, Fleck Bros. Ltd. v. Petroutsas	170
F. REPLEVIN	171
(a) The Replevin Act	171
(b) Supreme Court of Ontario, Rules of Practice	172
G. RECIPROCAL ENFORCEMENT OF JUDGMENTS	173
(a) Reciprocal Enforcement of Judgements Act	173
(b) The Reciprocal Enforcement of Maintenance Orders Act	175

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 7: THE EFFECT OF JUDGMENT AND INTEREST UPON JUDGMENT

		PAGE
A.	THE EFFECT OF JUDGMENT	176
	(a) Note	176
	(b) Case # 8, International Harvester Co. v. Hogan	178
	(c) Case # 9, Neilson v. Derko	180
	(d) Case # 10, Ball v. Thorne	181
B.	INTEREST ON JUDGMENT	182
	(a) The Legislation	183
	(i) The Judicature Act	183
	(ii) The Interest Act	183
	(iii) The Rules of Practice	183
	(b) Sample Chattel Mortgage	184
	(c) Case # 11, Economic Life Assurance Society v. Usborne	189
	(d) Case # 12, Sidan Investments Ltd. v. W.B. Sullivan Construction Ltd.	192

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
CHAPTER 8 : EXAMINATION OF THE JUDGMENT DEBTOR	196
A. INTRODUCTION	196
B. PROCEDURE	196
(a) Supreme Court of Ontario, Rules of Practice	196
(b) Small Claims Court Act	197
C. SOME CASES	200
(a) Case # 13, McCart v. McCart and Adams	200
(b) Case # 14, Spiegel v. Klein	202
(c) Case # 15, Beau Monde Ladies' Tailoring v. Garrett	203
(d) Case # 16, Hyatt v. Owens	205
D. EXAMPLE OF SUGGESTED QUESTIONS TO BE ASKED ON JUDGMENT DEBTOR EXAMINATIONS	206
(a) Questions to be Asked on Examination of the Judgment Debtor	206
(b) Questions to be Asked of Officer of Limited Company on Judgment Debtor Examinations	207
E. FORMS	208

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 9: EXEMPTIONS FROM THE EXECUTION PROCESS

		PAGE
A.	EXEMPTIONS FROM EXECUTION AND GARNISHMENT	211
	(a) Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Alberta, "History of Exemptions Legislation"	211
	(b) Exemption from Execution	212
	(i) Execution Act	212
	(ii) Note: Provincial Legislation Creating Exemptions from Execution	213
	(c) Exemptions From Garnishment	216
	(d) Distress for Rent: The Landlord and Tenant Act	218
	(e) The Indian Act	219
	(f) Social Welfare Benefits	219
	(i) Pension Benefits	219
	Case # 17, Bonus Finance Ltd. v. Smith	219
	(ii) Insurance Benefits	221
	Case # 18, Re Geraci	221
	(g) Wages	224
	(i) Wages Act	224
	(ii) Canada Shipping Act	225
	(iii) What are Wages?	226
	Case # 19, Holy Spirit Parish Credit Union Society v. Kwiatkowski et al	226
	(iv) Wage Assignments	228
	Case # 20, Regina v. Vannini, Ex Parte Le Blanc	228
	Case # 21, Cangeco (Peterborough) Credit Union Ltd. v. Trentway Bus Lines Ltd.	233
	(h) The Debtor's Home	236
B.	PROBLEM SITUATIONS	236
	(a) Attachment of Wages Owed by the Crown to its Employees	236
	Case # 22, Royal Bank of Canada v. Scott	237
	(b) The position of the Crown	241
	(i) Note	241
	(ii) Case # 23, Straka v. Straka	243
	(c) Property Substituted for Exempt Property	244
	(d) Chattels Ordinarily Used in a "Business, Profession or Calling"	244
	(i) Case # 24, Langdon v. Traders Finance Corp. et. al.	244
	(ii) Note	249
	(iii) Case # 25, Re Kreutzweiser	250
	(e) Exemptions - Right or Privilege?	253
	(i) Case # 26, Roy v. Fortin	253
	(ii) Note	256
	(f) Matrimonial Benefits	257
	Case # 27, Cairns v. St. Amour	257
C.	REFORM OF EXEMPTION LEGISLATION	259
	(a) Karlen, Exemptions from Execution	259
	(b) Trebilcock and Shulman, The Pathology of Credit Breakdown	260
	(c) Questions	260a

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 10: EXECUTION

A. INTRODUCTION 261

(a) Introductory Note 261

(b) The Execution Act 261

(c) Creditors' Relief Act 269

(d) Federal Court Act 269

(e) Supreme Court of Ontario Rules of Practice 271

(f) The Small Claims Court Act 275

B. FIERI FACIAS 278

(a) The Binding Effect 278

(i) La Forest, "Some Aspects of the Writ of Fieri Facias" 278

(ii) The Land Titles Act 278

(b) Issue and Renewal 280

(i) Supreme Court of Ontario Rules of Practice 280

(ii) Limitations Act 280

(iii) Note 281

(c) Exigible Property 284

(i) Generally 284

1. Dunlop, "Execution Against Personal Property in England and British Columbia" 284

2. Note: Property Subject to Execution 287

(ii) Real Estate Transactions 288

1. Note 288

2. Case # 28 Kimniak v. Anderson 289

3. Case # 29 Robinson v. Moffatt 292

4. Case #30 McDonald v. Royal Bank 294

5. Case #31 Davidson v. Davidson 296

(iii) Contingent Interests 299

(iv) Mortgages of Land 300

(v) Chattel Mortgages and Conditional Sales 300

1. Interest of Vendors and Mortgagees of Chattels 300

2. Interest of Purchasers and Mortgagors of Chattles 301

3. Case #32 Ruscheinsky v. A. Spencer Co. Ltd. 302

(vi) Money, Bills of Exchange and Specialties or Other Security for Money 303

(vii) Book Debts and Choses in Action 304

1. Note 304

2. Case #33 Re. A.G. Ont and Royal Bank of Canada 305

(viii) Joint Tenancies 309

1. Note 309

2. Case #34 Re Young 310

3. Case #35 Sirois v. Breton 312

(ix) Partnership Interests 315

1. Case #36 Sandham v. Sandham Brothers 315

(x) Company Shares 318

1. Note 318

2. Case #37 Associates Finance Co. Ltd. v. Webber, et al. 319

TABLE OF CONTENTS (cont.)

		PAGE
(d)	Purchasers of Goods from the Sheriff	324
	(i) Introductory Note	324
	(ii) Goods Subject to Conditional Sales	325
	Case # 38, Commercial Credit Corp. v. Niagara Finance Co.	326
	(iii) Goods Subject to a Chattel Mortgage	328
	Case # 39, Mutual Finance Corp. Ltd. v. Ganley	329
	Case # 40, In Re Dainty Confections Limited	331
	(iv) The Position Under the Personal Property Security Act	336
	(v) Interpleader	337
(e)	Functions and Responsibilities of the Sheriff	341
	(i) Relationship with the Execution Creditor	341
	Case # 41, Morris v. Salberg	341
	Case # 42, Graves v. Sprague	345
	(ii) The Mechanics of Seizure	346
	Case # 43, Watson v. Murray	346
	Case # 44, Re Bishop and Traders Finance Corporation Ltd. et. al.	350
	Case # 45, Regina v. Vroom	352
	(iii) The Use of Force	356
	Case # 46, Hudson v. Fletcher	358
	Case # 47, Vaughan v. McKenzie	360
	(iv) The Duty to Obtain a Fair Price	363
	Case # 48, Smith v. Colles	363
	Case # 49, Pease v. Tudge	364
	(v) Sheriff's File	368

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 11: GARNISHMENT

A. INTRODUCTION 401

(a) Note - Garnishment 401
(b) Supreme Court of Ontario Rules of Practice 401
(c) The Small Claims Courts Act (Sections 141-155, Section 130) 402
(d) The Apportionment Act (Sections 1(a), 1(b), 2, 3 406
(e) The Creditors' Relief Act 406
(f) Note - Rule 597 407
(g) Note - Special Creditors 407

B. EFFECT OF SERVICE OF THE GARNISHMENT ORDER 407

(a) Introductory Note 407
(b) Case # 50 , Kare v. North West Packers Ltd. and McGuckin 408
(c) Case # 51 , Industrial Development Bank v. Valley Dairy Ltd. 414
(d) Case # 52 , Imperial Oil Ltd. v. Abilene Contracting Co. Ltd. 415
(e) Note 418
(f) Note 418
(g) Case # 53 , Yates v. Terry 418
(h) Note 420

C. DEBTS SUBJECT TO GARNISHMENT 420

(a) Introductory Note 420
(b) Debts Owing or Accruing Due 422
(i) Case #54 , Quercetti v. Tranquilli 422
(ii) Case #55 , Garner v. Strickland and Western Forest Industries Ltd. 423
(iii) Case #56 , Lee v. MacDonald 425
(iv) Case #57 , Sandy v. Yukon 428
(v) Case #58 , Canadian Bank of Commerce v. Dabrowski and Hunt 431
(vi) D.M. Gordon, Case and Comment 432
(vii) Case #59 , Moir v. Franciotta 434
(c) Conditional/Contingent Debts 434
(i) Insurance Proceeds: Case #60, Vater v. Styles 434
(ii) Trust Funds: Case #61, Webb v. Stenton 437
(iii) Note: Conditional Debts 439
(d) Bank Accounts 441
(i) Deposit Accounts: Case #62 , Bel-Fran Investments Ltd. v. Pantuity Holdings Limited and Bank of Montreal (Garnishee) 441
(ii) Joint Accounts
1. Case #63 , Re Davis, Nash and Davis v. Royal Bank of Canada 444
2. Case #64 , Re Adler 447
3. Note 448
(e) Debts Owed to a Partnership: Case #65 , Hoon v. Maloff 449
(f) Other Debts Subject to Garnishment 451

D. PROTECTION OF WAGES 451

(a) Wages Act 451
(b) Note: The English Position 452
(c) Note: Protection of the Debtor-employee from Dismissal 453

G. SOME FORMS 454

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 12: RESIDUAL METHODS OF EXECUTION 460

A. INTRODUCTION 460

(a) Dunlop, "Execution Against Personal Property in England and British Columbia 460

B. EQUITABLE EXECUTION BY WAY OF APPOINTMENT OF RECEIVER 469

(a) The Judicature Act 469
(b) The Creditors Relief Act 469
(c) Some Cases 469
(i) #66, Re Karch 469
(ii) #67, Garry Finance Corp. Ltd. v. Heizman 470
(iii) #68, McCart v. McCart and Adams 472
(iv) #69, Collins v. Hall 473
(v) #70, Dowell v. Aikenhead 474
(d) Partnership Assets 475
(i) Ontario Supreme Court Rules of Practice 475
(ii) The Partnership Act 475

C. CHARGING ORDERS 476

(a) Judicature Act 476
(b) Ontario Supreme Court, Rules of Practice 477
(c) Ellis, "The Charging Order - A Neglected Means of Enforcement?" 477
(d) Note 480

D. ATTACHMENT, COMMITTAL AND SEQUESTRATION 480

(a) Ontario Supreme Court Rules of Practice 480
(b) Small Claims Court Act 481
(c) Note 482